



Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT

kitchen, and family room. The upper level would consist of three bedrooms and three bathrooms.

The landscaping plan for the project includes various retaining walls along the driveway and along the right side of the residence. A driveway gate and pedestrian entry gate would be constructed, and an iron fence 6 feet in height would be located along the front property line. A 6 foot tall wire mesh deer fence would also run along the southern property line. The landscape plan also includes provisions for substantial groundcover and several Sweet Gum trees and Japanese Maple trees around the residence. A cluster of evergreen shrubs are proposed along the eastern and northern property lines.

The gross floor area of the proposed home is 3,095 square feet, which is below the floor area limit for the property. The proposed lot coverage of the project is 18%, which is below the 30% maximum for the R-1 zoning district.

The color and materials have not changed from the previous application. The exterior plaster stucco would be a beige-orange tone with pale blue trim and light blue wooden window frames. The roofing would be antique slate colored composition shingles. A color and materials board will be available for review at the Board meeting.

BACKGROUND

A previous Site Plan and Architectural Review Application (File #704150) had been filed for a similar project in late 2004. That proposed residence was 103 square feet larger than that of the currently proposed application. The application was reviewed by the Design review Board on November 4 and December 16, 2004. At that time, the owners of the property at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard raised concerns about potential view impacts, and the downhill neighbors at 1 Hillcrest Drive raised concern about the looming impact of the structure. The property owners at 19 Hillcrest Drive and other surrounding neighbors also raised concern about potential landslide and traffic issues.

It was the consensus of the Board that the project design did not sufficiently address the view impact concerns of neighbors nor sufficiently adhere to the Hillside Design Guidelines with respect to terracing and stepping into the slope. The Board directed the applicant to further utilize the lot coverage allowance on the lot and suggested that by spreading the building out more and relocating it toward the northwest corner of the property, the view impacts could be mitigated. The application was continued to allow the applicant to address these concerns. The applicant ultimately withdrew the previous application, and has now submitted the subject application with the modified plans for the proposed single-family residence.

ANALYSIS:

Zoning

The project would be in conformance with the development regulations of the R-1 zoning district.



Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT

Design issues

The subject property is surrounded by single-family homes which are generally designed to take advantage of the views of San Francisco Bay to the east. The adjacent property to the east (downhill) at 1 Hillcrest Drive is developed with a one-story single-family home. The adjacent property to the northwest (uphill) at 19 Hillcrest Drive is developed with a two-story single-family home. The properties across the street at 8 and 4 Hillcrest Drive are also developed with eastward facing single-family homes. The home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard is located behind the subject property, and has views across the property toward San Francisco Bay and the Richmond-San Rafael Bridge.

The proposed home would have a somewhat terraced design. The structure would have a three-story appearance from the east and north perspectives. The south and west elevations would have a two story appearance. The living room terrace and upper level balcony off the bedrooms are designed to take advantage of the views to the east. The living room would be located over the garage with the roof of the garage also partially serving as a terrace for the living room above. A portion of the ceiling over the office and dining room on the main level would also be used as a balcony for two of the upper level bedrooms. The main level would have a greater amount of living space than the upper level, and bedroom #3 on the upper level would be pushed out toward the southwest corner, creating an overhang below.

The entry area would be covered with a roof overhang supported by pillars. The overhang in the southwest corner of the structure would create a similar loggia with supporting pillars. A trellis would extend beyond the loggia to provide for a shaded terrace that could be accessed from the family room on the main level.

The north elevation would be articulated with varying roof lines and stepped elements. The east and south elevations of the building would be partially articulated with numerous windows. The north and west elevations would, however, have some plain stucco faces. Split face concrete block would be used along the perimeter of the garage door, and would extend along the basement level of the structure.

The size of the residence does not appear to be out of scale for the neighborhood; however, the partially subterranean basement level and the loggia created by the bedroom overhang would appear to contribute unnecessary mass and bulk to the structure. There is a variety in home designs for residences in the neighborhood, so the proposed stucco structure would not be out of character with the surrounding neighborhood.

Although the proposed structure would be visible from the residences across Hillcrest Drive as well as the residences above and below the property along Hillcrest Drive, it does not appear that it would interfere with views from these homes. The proposed structure has been relocated up the hill and closer to the front property line to reduce the view obstruction from 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard. The Board should revisit the property at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard to evaluate the potential view impacts from the existing residence.



Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT

Although the revised project design does somewhat address the hillside integration and view blockage issues previously raised by the Board, the visual mass of the building has not been reduced.

The Board previously used the following portions of the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines to evaluate the design of the project.

- Goal 1, Principle 2 of the Guidelines states that “to increase the integration of building and site, the hillside contours and slope should be followed.” The current design cuts into the hillside, and the structure follows the slope more so than the previous design, but the appearance of a three story structure on the downhill portion of the site does not appear to be an integrated design.
- Goal 1, Principle 5 of the Guidelines states that “hillside contours should be followed with horizontal building elements.” The original design did not demonstrate horizontal elements that were integrated with the slope; however, the recent project utilizes more horizontal features with rooftop terraces.

The following portions of the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines should also be used to evaluate the potential view impacts of the house in its currently proposed location for the home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard:

- Goal 3, Principle 7 (A) of the Hillside Design Guidelines states that “view protection is more important for the primary living areas of a dwelling... than for the less actively used areas of a dwelling.” Although the proposed structure would be visible from primary living areas of the home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard, the currently proposed house would only minimally block views.
- Goal 3, Principle 7 (C) of the Guidelines states that “blockage of [the] center of view [is] more damaging than blockage of [the] side of view.” The currently proposed house would not block the center of the view, but it would block the corner of the view from the home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard.
- Goal 3, Principle 7 (D) of the Guidelines states that “blockage of important objects in the view (Golden Gate Bridge, Belvedere Lagoon, Sausalito, Angel Island) is more difficult to accept than blockage of other, less well known landmarks.” The currently proposed house would slightly diminish the views of the Richmond-San Rafael Bridge.
- Goal 3, Principle 7 (E) of the Guidelines states that “a wide panoramic view can accept more view blockage than the smaller slot view.” The currently proposed house would block a small portion of a moderately sized view from the home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard.



Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT

The Board may want to consider whether this constitutes a borrowed view across a vacant lot. The Board should also consider whether the proposed design has been modified sufficiently to effectively mitigate the view impacts on the home at 305 Trestle Glen Boulevard.

On a more technical matter, Staff has noted that the proposed driveway gate does not comply with the policy requiring vehicle entry gates to be located at least 15 feet from the roadway. The project has been conditioned to ensure that the gate be relocated to comply with the policy.

Public Comment

One letter was received from the property owner at 19 Hillcrest Drive concerning an existing fence omitted from the plans, the location of the sewer connection being inaccurate, and requesting further information about the driveway retaining walls.

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Board review this project with respect to Zoning Ordinance Section 4.02.07 (Guiding Principles) and determine that the project is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as specified in Section 15303. If the Board finds that the design of the project is consistent with the Guiding Principles for Site Plan and Architectural Review, then it is recommended that the project be approved with the attached Conditions of Approval.

EXHIBITS:

1. Conditions of Approval
2. Application and supplemental materials dated March 21, 2005
3. Plans for the project
4. Letter from Sophia and Abner Kingman, received April 6, 2005
5. Staff Report and Minutes from Design Review Board Meeting on December 16, 2004
6. Staff Report and Minutes from Design Review Board Meeting November 4, 2004

Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT



EXHIBIT 1

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL 7 HILLCREST DRIVE FILE #705041

1. This approval shall be used within three (3) years of the approval date, and shall become null and void unless a building permit has been issued.
2. The development of this project shall conform to the application and plans dated March 21, 2005 by the Town of Tiburon, or as amended by these conditions of approval. Any modifications to the plans must be reviewed and approved by the Design Review Board.
3. Plans submitted to the Building Department for plan check shall be identical to those approved by the Design Review Board. If any changes are made to the approved Design Review plans, the permit holder is responsible for clearly identifying all such changes when submitted to the Building Department for plan check. Such changes must be clearly highlighted (with a "bubble" or "cloud") on the submitted plans. A list describing in detail all such changes shall be submitted and attached to the building plans, with a signature block to be signed by the Design Review Staff member indicating that these changes have been reviewed and are approved, or require additional Design Review. All changes that have not been explicitly approved by Staff as part of the Building Plan Check process are not approved. Construction that does not have Design Review approval is not valid and shall be subject to stop work orders and may require removal.
4. The applicant must meet all requirements of other agencies prior to the issuance of a building permit for this project.
5. All exterior lighting fixtures other than those approved by the Design Review Board must be down light type fixtures.
6. The roof overhang on the lower level on the west side of the building shall not encroach into the side yard setback by more than three (3) feet.
7. The location of the story poles must be certified by a licensed surveyor. Any changes in the story poles must be approved by the Design Review Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit.
8. Prior to under-floor inspection, a certified survey of the structure foundation will be required. Required documents shall include graphic documentation locating the building on a site plan and including specific dimensions from property lines and other reference points as appropriate, and elevations relative to sea level of the foundation walls and

Town of Tiburon

STAFF REPORT



slabs. No inspections will be provided until the survey results have been verified.

9. The project shall comply with the following requirements of the Tiburon Fire Protection District:
 - a. The structure shall have installed throughout an automatic fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA standard 13-D. The system design, installation and final testing shall be approved by the District Fire Prevention Officer (UFC 1003).
 - b. Approved smoke alarms shall be installed to provide protection to all sleeping areas (UBC 310).
 - c. Approved spark arresters shall be installed on chimneys (UFC 1109).
 - d. A "green-belt" shall be provided by cutting and clearing all combustible vegetation within 30 feet of the structure.
 - e. The access gate shall have a minimum unobstructed width of 12'. Gates shall be operable using the Fire District's "Knox" key system.

10. The following requirements of the Marin Municipal Water District shall be met:
 - a. A copy of the building permit shall be submitted.
 - b. Appropriate fees shall be paid.
 - c. The applicant shall comply with the District's rules and regulations in effect at the time service is requested.

11. All requirements of the Town Engineer shall be met.