



TOWN OF TIBURON
1505 Tiburon Boulevard
Tiburon, CA 94920

Design Review Board Meeting
February 19, 2009
Agenda Item: **D1**

STAFF REPORT

To: Members of the Design Review Board

From: Planning Manager Watrous

**Subject: 215 Blackfield Drive; File #709013
Site Plan and Architectural Review for the Exterior Colors and
Materials for Previously Approved Construction of Additions and
Renovations to an Existing Religious Facility and Day School
(Congregation Kol Shofar)**

PROJECT DATA

ADDRESS: 215 BLACKFIELD DRIVE
ASSESSOR'S PARCEL: 038-351-34
FILE NUMBER: 709013
PROPERTY OWNERS: CONGREGATION KOL SHOFAR
ARCHITECT: HERMAN & COLIVER ARCHITECTURE
LOT SIZE: 6.94 ACRES
ZONING: RO-1 (SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL-OPEN)
GENERAL PLAN: MEDIUM LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL
FLOOD ZONE: C
DATE COMPLETE: FEBRUARY 6, 2009

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

An Environmental Impact Report was previously certified by the Town Council for this project in conformance with the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The CEQA analysis for this project encompasses all portions of the project proposed under the subject application. No further environmental review is required.

PROPOSAL

The applicant is requesting Design Review approval for the exterior colors and materials for a previously approved project (File # 707122) involving the construction of additions and renovations to an existing religious facility and day school (Congregation Kol Shofar). The project involved the construction of a new multi-purpose room addition and a new classroom building, along with renovation of interior spaces of existing buildings, installation of new skylights, reconfiguration and expansion of existing parking areas, improved pedestrian access around the site and improved on-site landscaping.

The Design Review Board approved the previous project on November 15, 2007. At that time, the Board had concerns about the color palette for the project, but agreed that the plaster finish was appropriate for the exterior walls of the multi-purpose building and classroom addition. The Board approved the project, but required that the exterior walls of the multi-purpose building be finished with plaster or equivalent materials and that the color palette for the multi-purpose building and classroom addition be reviewed and approved by the Design Review Board prior to issuance of a building permit for the construction of these additions. The applicant is going through the building plan check process for this project and has now submitted a revised color and materials palette described as follows:

- The exterior walls of the multi-purpose building would utilize olive and light brown colored plaster, “Jerusalem Gold” limestone and olive stained cedar siding.
- The walls of the classroom addition would utilize light green and charcoal grey cement fiber panels for the exterior walls, with brick red upper vertical elements, doors and canopies.
- Charcoal grey and lighter grey trim would be used throughout, with the exception of red aluminum used for several building entries and canopies.
- The roof would utilize a medium brown composite roofing material.
- Hardscape elements would utilize earth tone colored pavers and concrete.

ANALYSIS

In 2006, the Town Council approved the Kol Shofar expansion project under a conditional use permit (File #10404) and certified an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the project. One of the mitigation measures contained in the EIR (Measure 3.5-A.1) requires that “Buildings and roofs will be earth-tone colors as approved by the Town.” Most of the proposed exterior colors clearly meet this requirement. The proposed green elements are relatively subdued and should compliment much of the existing and proposed vegetation on the site.

The red colored elements should be carefully evaluated to ensure that these portions of the buildings do not visually stand out from the remainder of the structures on the site. The red entries and canopies would help direct pedestrians to the entrances and should not be particularly visible from nearby homes, but Staff believes that the roof of all canopies should be colored brown to better blend in with the remainder of the building roofs when viewed from homes above the site. Staff also believes that the red portions of the classroom addition, particularly the upper vertical elements, would be more visually prominent and could create an overly contrasting “two-tone” color scheme. Staff would recommend an alternate, more subdued color for the vertical elements of the classroom addition that could be reviewed at a later date by Planning Division Staff.

PUBLIC COMMENT

As of the date of this report, one letter has been received regarding this application from a resident across the street from Kol Shofar raising concerns with the proposed red colored materials for the project.

RECOMMENDATION

The Board should review this project with respect to Zoning Ordinance Sections 16-4.2.7 (Guiding Principles). If the Design Review Board agrees with Staff's conclusions, it is recommended that the attached conditions of approval be applied.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Conditions of approval
2. Application and supplemental materials
3. Minutes of the November 15, 2007 Design Review Board meeting
4. Letter from Samantha Winter, dated February 10, 2009
5. Submitted plans

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

215 BLACKFIELD DRIVE

FILE #709013

1. This approval shall be used within three (3) years of the approval date, and shall become null and void unless a building permit has been issued.
2. The development of this project shall conform with the application dated by the Town of Tiburon on January 29, 2009, or as amended by these conditions of approval. Any modifications to the plans of January 29, 2009 must be reviewed and approved by the Design Review Board.
3. Plans submitted to the Building Division for plan check shall be identical to those approved by the Design Review Board. If any changes are made to the approved Design Review plans, the permit holder is responsible for clearly identifying all such changes when submitted to the Building Division for plan check. Such changes must be clearly highlighted (with a “bubble” or “cloud”) on the submitted plans. A list describing in detail all such changes shall be submitted and attached to the building plans, with a signature block to be signed by the Planning Division Staff member indicating that these changes have been reviewed and are approved, or require additional Design Review. All changes that have not been explicitly approved by Staff as part of the Building Plan Check process are not approved. Construction that does not have Planning Division approval is not valid and shall be subject to stop work orders and may require removal.
4. If this approval is challenged by a third party, the property owner/applicant will be responsible for defending against this challenge. The property owner/applicant agrees to defend, indemnify and hold the Town of Tiburon harmless from any costs, claims or liabilities arising from the approval, including, without limitations, any award of attorney’s fees that might result from the third party challenge.
5. The applicant must meet all requirements of other agencies prior to the issuance of a building permit for this project.
6. The project shall comply with all requirements of Town Council Resolution No. 15-2007.
7. The upper vertical elements of the classroom addition shall utilize a more subdued color to be approved by Planning Division Staff.
8. The color of the roof of all canopy areas shall closely resemble the main roof color.